

*Courts of Justice Act*

**ONTARIO  
SUPERIOR COURT OF JUSTICE**

BETWEEN:

**RANDY HILLIER**

Applicant

-and-

**HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN IN RIGHT  
OF THE PROVINCE OF ONTARIO**

Respondent

---

**AFFIDAVIT OF DR. THOMAS WARREN  
SWORN THE 8th DAY OF SEPTEMBER, 2022**

---

I, Dr. Thomas Warren, of the Town of Oakville, in the Province of Ontario, MAKE OATH AND SAY AS FOLLOWS:

1. I have personal knowledge of the facts and matters hereinafter deposed to by me, except where same are stated to be based upon information and belief, and those I do verily believe to be true.
2. I am a full time Infectious Diseases Consultant and Medical Microbiologist with Halton Healthcare in Oakville, Ontario.
3. In 2013, I was appointed Assistant Clinical Professor (Adjunct) at McMaster University Department of Medicine, Faculty of Health and Sciences and I still hold such appointment as of the date of this my Affidavit.
4. From 2012 to 2021, I was a supervisor for physician assistant students, medical students, residents and infectious disease fellows from the University of Toronto and McMaster University for Infection Diseases clinical rotations.

5. In 2008 and 2009 I taught microbiology to second year medical students with the University of Toronto.
6. I am in good standing as a member with the Association of Medical Microbiology and Infectious Diseases Canada, the Canadian Medical Association, Canadian Medical Protective Association, the College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario, Ontario Medical Association and the Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Canada.
7. My qualifications are set out in the attached Curriculum Vitae (“CV”) and marked as **Exhibit “A”** to this my Affidavit.
8. I have reviewed studies relevant to transmission of the SARS-CoV-2 virus and have broad experience with the issues of infectious diseases and virus transmission and have over 10 years of practice as an Infectious Diseases Consultant and Microbiologist.
9. I have been asked by counsel for the Applicants to prepare a report as an expert witness to provide my professional opinions on the following questions:
  - a) What is the risk of COVID-19 transmission in outside settings?
  - b) How does community disease rate change after a large outdoor gathering?
  - c) What is the risk of COVID-19 transmission in outside settings where there are no or limited a) masking; and b) social distancing?
10. My signed Acknowledgement of Expert’s Duty to this Honourable Court as an expert is attached as **Exhibit “B”** to this my Affidavit.

11. I acknowledge that in preparing this report and providing expert evidence, the Applicants' counsel explained that my role is to assist the court to determine the matters in issue. I further acknowledge that it is my duty to provide evidence that is fair, objective and non-partisan and to opine only on matters that are within my areas of expertise. This duty prevails over any obligations that I may owe to any party on whose behalf I am engaged.
12. Attached hereto and marked as **Exhibit "C"** to this my Affidavit is a copy of my report which I adopt and sets out the information and assumptions on which my opinion is based and a summary of my opinion.
13. Where I have relied on a document or data in forming my opinion, I have set out the citation to that document or data in the endnotes

SWORN REMOTELY by videoconference by )  
Dr. Thomas Warren at the Town of Oakville, )  
Ontario, before me at the City of Brampton, )  
this 9 day of September, 2022 in accordance )  
with O.Reg. 431/20 Administering Oath or )  
Declaration Remotely )

*Henna Parmar*

---

**HENNA PARMAR**  
**Barrister & Solicitor**



---

**DR. THOMAS WARREN**

This is **Exhibit "A"** referred to in the  
Affidavit of **Dr. Thomas Warren** sworn  
before me virtually this 8 day of  
September, 2022.

*Henna Parmar*

---

Barrister and Solicitor in the  
Province of Ontario

# Thomas A. Warren, MD

## Employment

---

- 2011 - **Infectious Diseases consultant & Medical Microbiologist**  
Halton Healthcare, Oakville ON
- 2010-2011 **Internal Medicine specialist – locum coverage**  
St. Michael's Hospital, Toronto ON  
Hamilton Health Sciences, Hamilton ON  
Lakeridge Health, Oshawa ON
- 2010-2011 **University of Toronto**  
Department of Laboratory Medicine & Pathobiology, Toronto ON  
*Resident, Medical Microbiology*
- 2008-2010 **University of Toronto**  
Department of Medicine, Division of Infectious Diseases, Toronto ON  
*Fellow, Infectious Diseases*
- 2005-2008 **University of Ottawa**  
Department of Medicine, Ottawa ON  
*Resident, Internal Medicine*
- 1997-2003 **University of Western Ontario**  
Department of Medicine, London ON  
*Computer Programmer & Web Developer*

## Education

---

- 2018 - **London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, University of London**  
*Master's of Science (Epidemiology)*  
Expected Completion 2022
- 2010-2011 **Royal College of Physicians & Surgeons of Canada**  
*Residency in Medical Microbiology*

- 2008-2010      **Royal College of Physicians & Surgeons of Canada**  
*Fellowship in Infectious Diseases*
- 2005-2008      **Royal College of Physicians & Surgeons of Canada**  
*Residency in Internal Medicine*
- 2001-2005      **University of Western Ontario**  
Schulich School of Medicine & Dentistry  
*Doctor of Medicine*
- 1997-2001      **University of Western Ontario**  
*Bachelor of Science - Honors Microbiology & Immunology*  
*(Scholar's Electives Program)*  
Graduated With Distinction

### **Continuing Medical Education**

---

- 2018              **IDEAS Foundations of Quality Improvement Program**  
May 30  
McMaster University  
Hamilton, ON
- 2018              **Clinical Teaching Fundamentals**  
January – March  
McMaster University  
Hamilton, ON

### **Peer-Reviewed Publications**

---

- 2015              **Warren T**, Lau R, Ralevski F, Rau N, Boggild AK.  
Fever in a visitor to Canada: a case of mistaken identity.  
*J Clin Microbiol.* 53:1783-1785.
- 2012              **Warren TA**, Yau Y, Ratjen F, Tullis E, Waters V.  
Serum galactomannan in cystic fibrosis patients colonized with *Aspergillus*  
species.  
*Medical Mycology.* 2012; 50: 658-660.
- 2010              **Warren TA**, McTaggart L, Richardson SE, Zhang SX.  
*Candida bracarensis* Bloodstream Infection in an Immunocompromised Patient.  
*Journal of Clinical Microbiology.* 2010; 48: 4677–4679.

## Abstracts & Conference Presentations

---

- 2011      **Warren TA**, Yau Y, Waters V.  
Serum galactomannan in cystic fibrosis patients colonized with *Aspergillus* species.  
Poster session presented at: Association of Medical Microbiology and Infectious Disease (AMMI) Canada 2011 Annual Conference  
2011 April 7-9; Montreal, QC.
- 2010      **Warren TA**, Yau Y, Waters V.  
Serum galactomannan in cystic fibrosis patients colonized with *Aspergillus* species.  
Poster session presented at: North American Cystic Fibrosis Conference  
2010 October 21-23; Baltimore, MD.
- 2010      **Warren TA**, Govindapillai S, Tullis E, Devlin HR, Ferris W, Matukas LM.  
Evaluation of Etest Combination Testing of Antibiotics Against Isolates from Patients with Cystic Fibrosis.  
Poster session presented at: 50th Interscience Conference on Antimicrobial Agents and Chemotherapy  
2010 September 12-15; Boston, MA.
- 2010      **Warren TA**, Rotstein C, Cole EH, Singer LG, Keshavjee S4, Husain S.  
Posaconazole therapy in solid organ transplant recipients refractory to or intolerant of standard therapy.  
Poster session presented at: Canadian Society for Transplantation Annual Conference  
2010 August 12-15; Vancouver, BC.
- 2010      **Warren TA**, McTaggart L, Zhang S. *Candida bracarensis*  
Blood Stream Infection in an Immunocompromised Patient: Case Report.  
Poster session presented at: Focus on Fungal Infections  
2010 March 3-5; New Orleans, LA.
- 2007      **Warren TA**, McCarthy AE.  
A Ten-Year Retrospective Study of Vaccination Rates, Prophylactic Antibiotic Use, Serious Infection and Overwhelming Postsplenectomy Sepsis Rates in Splenectomized Patients.  
Poster session presented at: Annual Meeting of the Infectious Diseases Society of America  
2007 October 4-7; San Diego, CA.

## Awards

---

- 2011            **Best Student Poster Award – 2011 Annual Conference**  
 Association of Medical Microbiology and Infectious Disease (AMMI) Canada  
 Montreal, QC
- 2010            **ASM ICAAC Infectious Diseases Fellows Grant**  
 2010 Interscience Conference on Antimicrobial Agents and Chemotherapy  
 Boston, MA
- 2008            **Internal Medicine CanMeds Award for Communication**  
 University of Ottawa, Department of Medicine  
 Ottawa, ON
- 2006            **Resident Research Day Award of Excellence – PGY1**  
 University of Ottawa, Department of Medicine  
 Ottawa, ON
- 2001            **Laurene Paterson scholarship**  
 University of Western Ontario  
 London, ON
- 1997-2001     **Dean's Honor List**  
 University of Western Ontario, Faculty of Science  
 London, ON
- 1997            **Western Scholarship of Excellence**  
 University of Western Ontario  
 London, ON

## Appointments

---

- 2013 -            **McMaster University**  
 Assistant Clinical Professor (Adjunct)  
 Department of Medicine, Faculty of Health Sciences  
 Hamilton, ON

## Teaching

---

- 2012-2021     **Infectious Diseases – Clinical Rotations**  
 Supervised physician assistant students, medical students, residents and  
 infectious diseases fellows from the University of Toronto and McMaster  
 University  
 Oakville, ON



- 2009            **Pathobiology of Disease**  
*Taught microbiology to second year medical students*  
University of Toronto  
Toronto, ON
- 2008            **Pathobiology of Disease**  
*Taught microbiology to second year medical students*  
University of Toronto  
Toronto, ON
- 2008            **Physical Skills Development Course**  
*Taught physical exam skills to first year medical students*  
University of Ottawa  
Ottawa, ON

## **Memberships**

---

Association of Medical Microbiology and Infectious Diseases Canada

Canadian Medical Association

Canadian Medical Protective Association

College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario

Ontario Medical Association

Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Canada

This is **Exhibit “B”** referred to in the  
Affidavit of **Dr. Thomas Warren** sworn  
before me virtually this 8 day of  
September, 2022.

*Henna Parmar*

---

Barrister and Solicitor in the  
Province of Ontario

FORM 53  
*Courts of Justice Act*

**ONTARIO  
SUPERIOR COURT OF JUSTICE**

BETWEEN:

**RANDY HILLIER**

Applicant

-and-

**HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN IN RIGHT  
OF THE PROVINCE OF ONTARIO**

Respondent

---

**ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF EXPERT'S DUTY**

---

1. My name is Dr. Thomas Warren. I live at the Town of Oakville, in the Province of Ontario.
2. I have been engaged by or on behalf of Randy Hillier, the Applicant, to provide evidence in relation to the above-noted court proceeding.
3. I acknowledge that it is my duty to provide evidence in relation to this proceeding as follows:
  - (a) to provide opinion evidence that is fair, objective and non-partisan;
  - (b) to provide opinion evidence that is related only to matters that are within my area of expertise; and
  - (c) to provide such additional assistance as the court may reasonably require, to determine a matter in issue.
4. I acknowledge that the duty referred to above prevails over any obligation which I may owe to any party by whom or on whose behalf I am engaged.

Date: September 8 2022



Signature

**NOTE:** This form must be attached to any expert report under subrules 53.03(1) or (2) and any opinion evidence provided by an expert witness on a motion or application.

This is **Exhibit "C"** referred to in the  
Affidavit of **Dr. Thomas Warren** sworn  
before me virtually this 8 day of  
September, 2022.

*Henna Parmar*

---

Barrister and Solicitor in the  
Province of Ontario

## **SARS-CoV-2 and COVID-19**

Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) is a novel coronavirus. There are six other coronaviruses that are known to infect humans. Four coronaviruses, HCoV-NL63, HCoV-HKU1, HCoV-229E, and HCoV-OC43 circulate worldwide and together are the second most common cause of the common cold<sup>1</sup>. Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 1 (SARS-CoV-1) infected 8096 people in 2003 resulting in 774 deaths<sup>2</sup>. After 2003 there has not been any further human to human transmission. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV) was first identified in humans in 2012<sup>3</sup>. MERS-CoV continues to cause sporadic infection and outbreaks in the Arabian peninsula, as well as occasional other cases and outbreaks in other parts of the world linked to travelers to the Arabian peninsula<sup>4</sup>.

Bats were the source of SARS-CoV-1<sup>5</sup> and are known to be a natural reservoir for related coronaviruses<sup>6</sup>. In late 2019, SARS-CoV-2 was first detected in humans and is established as the cause of the disease now designated coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19). Approximately 30-40% of persons with SARS-CoV-2 infection are asymptomatic<sup>7</sup>. In those who are symptomatic, there is a wide range of illness from those with mild symptoms such as runny nose to those with severe disease affecting particularly the respiratory tract with high mortality<sup>8</sup>. Most people with SARS-CoV-2 infection are asymptomatic or have mild-moderate symptoms not requiring hospitalization. In one study of a relatively healthy population, those with COVID-19 requiring hospital care was < 2%, and the mortality rate was < 0.1%<sup>9</sup>. Infection with the Omicron variant has resulted in lower rates of hospitalization, less severe illness, and lower mortality compared to previous variants such as Alpha and Delta<sup>10</sup>.

### **Transmission and mortality**

The timing of peak SARS-CoV-2 transmission is primarily affected by seasonal patterns (i). The scale of SARS-CoV-2 transmission in a susceptible population is primarily determined by population density (ii). The mortality of COVID-19 is primarily determined by the age structure of the population (iii). Each of these important factors for SARS-CoV-2 transmission and mortality is non-modifiable.

(i) The timing of peak SARS-CoV-2 transmission is primarily affected by seasonal patterns.

The four human coronaviruses (OC43, 229E, NL63, HKU1) are known to have a seasonal pattern of increased transmission<sup>11</sup>. The peak of the transmission wave in the United States is in the coldest months of the year, usually January. SARS-CoV-2 transmission appears to have a similar seasonal pattern of transmission to the other seasonal human coronaviruses<sup>12</sup>. There are numerous studies that show climate (season) is one of the most important factors for SARS-CoV-2 transmission<sup>13</sup>. In general, colder temperatures are associated with increased SARS-CoV-2 transmission.

(ii) The scale of SARS-CoV-2 transmission is primarily determined by population density.

The transmission of SARS-CoV-2 is strongly associated with population density, particularly population-weighted density<sup>14</sup>. In the United States, incidence and mortality are ten times higher in the most densely populated areas compared to the least densely populated areas<sup>15</sup>. The association between population density and SARS-CoV-2 transmission has been identified in Europe<sup>16</sup>, Italy<sup>17</sup>, India<sup>18</sup>, Argentina<sup>19</sup>, Turkey<sup>20</sup>, Algeria<sup>21</sup>, Brazil<sup>22</sup>, Japan<sup>23</sup>, and China<sup>24</sup>.

This is also evident in Canada. Provinces with the highest population density (e.g. Ontario) have the highest number of cases. Within provinces (e.g. Ontario), regions with the highest population density have the highest number of cases (e.g. Toronto).

(iii) The mortality of COVID-19 is primarily determined by the age structure of the population.

Age is the most important risk factor for COVID-19 mortality. Compared to persons under age 40, persons over the age of 80 have a greater than 300 times chance of dying from COVID-19<sup>25</sup>. The infection fatality ratio (IFR) in persons over 80 is approximately 1000 times the IFR in those under 20<sup>26</sup>. In Canada, 61% of deaths are in persons over 80, 82% of deaths are in persons over 70, and 93% of deaths are in persons over 60<sup>27</sup>.

The risk of death due to COVID-19 in persons under 50 is very small<sup>28</sup>. In Canada, the risk of death due to COVID-19 in persons < 50 is less than the risk of death due to a motor vehicle fatality<sup>29</sup>. Globally, excess mortality related to COVID-19 is concentrated in persons over age 60, and particularly in persons over age 75; excess mortality related to COVID-19 was generally not seen in age groups less than age 60<sup>30</sup>. The attributable mortality due to COVID-19 is similar to influenza in persons aged less than 60<sup>31</sup>.

## **1. What is the risk of COVID-19 transmission in outside settings?**

### **A. Outdoor transmission of respiratory infections**

It has been known for centuries that transmission of respiratory tract infections occurs much less frequently outdoors<sup>32</sup>. Tuberculosis (TB) and influenza are very important respiratory infections and have killed (cumulatively) hundreds of millions of people over centuries and millennia. The risk of outdoor transmission is considered very low for these very important human infections, as it is for all other respiratory tract infections.

TB is transmitted through airborne particles. The *Canadian Tuberculosis Standards* published by the Public Health Agency of Canada state that TB “transmission is rarely thought to occur outdoors”<sup>33</sup> and the “risk of [outdoor] transmission is negligible provided they are not in very close contact with susceptible individuals for prolonged periods of time”<sup>34</sup>. The result is that “outdoor exposures are not investigated during a contact tracing exercise”<sup>35</sup>.

Influenza is another important respiratory tract infection. In a systematic review of outdoor mass gatherings and respiratory disease (mostly influenza) performed by the United States Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, “no single-day mass gathering-related outbreaks were identified in our review”<sup>36</sup>. Similarly, a global review of outbreaks (including influenza outbreaks) at outdoor large gatherings from 1980 to July 2012 did not identify any outbreaks associated with single day gatherings<sup>37</sup>. These studies and others were included in a systematic review of outdoor transmission of SARS-CoV-2 and other respiratory viruses; influenza outbreaks only occurred in the context of multiday outdoor events or communal housing<sup>38</sup>.

In the absence of definitive evidence to the contrary, it can be assumed that the risk of outdoor transmission of SARS-CoV-2 is very low, like influenza and TB. The burden of proof requires evidence to the contrary, showing that outdoor transmission of SARS-CoV-2 is significant. In the absence of that evidence, the default assumption remains that the risk of outdoor transmission of SARS-CoV-2 is low. It would be remarkable if SARS-CoV-2 was the first respiratory tract infection in history to have significant outdoor transmission.

## **B. Where SARS-CoV-2 is known to be transmitted**

The most common place for SARS-CoV-2 transmission is within households<sup>39</sup>; a Canadian study showed that odds of SARS-CoV-2 transmission in households was 44 times higher than in schools<sup>40</sup>. A study of households in Utah found that the household secondary attack rate was 36%, but the likelihood of a person in the study acquiring SARS-CoV-2 infection outside their household was only 0.41%<sup>41</sup>. A study performed in Switzerland estimated that a person was more than three times more likely to be infected with COVID-19 from a household member than from someone outside their household<sup>42</sup>. Household transmission accounted for 78%-85% of all SARS-CoV-2 transmission in China in one report from the World Health Organization<sup>43</sup>. Household contacts and travel together were the most important sources of SARS-CoV-2 transmission in another study<sup>44</sup>. Outbreaks in other indoor contexts where people live/sleep - such as long-term care facilities, hospitals, jails, and shelters - have also been established as an important source of indoor transmission in the Canadian context<sup>45</sup>.

## **C. Transmission of SARS-CoV-2 outdoors**

Increased time spent outdoors lowers the odds of acquiring SARS-CoV-2<sup>46</sup>. Using anonymized mobility flows derived from global mobile phone tracking data between February 2020 and February 2021 there was no evidence that increased visits to outdoor spaces increased COVID-19 transmission<sup>47</sup>. In one comprehensive study from China<sup>48</sup>, only one outdoor outbreak involving two cases occurred out of 7324 identified cases. The reason for the very low risk of outdoor transmission is that “outdoor concentration of the exhaled droplets can be safely assumed to be zero in almost all situations”<sup>49</sup>, and airflow outdoors rapidly dilutes any SARS-CoV-2 virus present to negligible amounts<sup>50</sup>.

## **D. Conclusion**

The transmission of any respiratory tract infection outdoors is low. SARS-CoV-2 is known to be transmitted primarily indoors, particularly in households and other places of residence (hospitals, jails, long-term care homes, shelters). The risk of SARS-CoV-2 transmission outdoors is very low.

## **2. How does community disease rate change after a large outdoor gathering?**

Large outdoor gatherings vary substantially in several factors known to be important to SARS-CoV-2 transmission. First, multi-day outdoor events such as music festivals should not be considered outdoor events because there are overnight components that occur indoors, and (as shown above) the risk of SARS-CoV-2 transmission is much higher indoors. Second, the duration of outdoor events is an important factor. Transmission at large outdoor gatherings with a long duration does result in increased SARS-CoV-2 transmission. An outdoor music festival lasting 16.5 hours (2:00 pm to 6:30 am) resulted in increased SARS-CoV-2 transmission<sup>51</sup>.

Large outdoor gatherings of a relatively short duration such as professional soccer<sup>52</sup> and football<sup>53</sup> matches do not result in an increased risk of COVID-19. Outdoor gatherings of a similarly short duration, such as political protests or religious gatherings, should be expected to have a similar risk of COVID-19.

## **3. What is the risk of COVID-19 transmission in outside settings where there are no or limited a) masking b) social distancing**

There is scant direct evidence for the benefit of masking or physical distancing outdoors. The effect of masking outdoors and social distancing outdoors can be extrapolated from the risk of outdoor transmission (sections 1 and 2 above), the benefit of masking in general (section 3.A below), and the benefit of social distancing in general (section 3.B below).

### **A. Masking**

#### **i. Evidence for the masking of healthy people in the community to prevent infection with respiratory viruses prior to COVID-19**

The best evidence for any medical intervention comes from large randomized controlled trials or meta-analysis of randomized trials. Prior to 2020, there were no randomized controlled trials or meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials that supported the effectiveness of masking of healthy people in the community to prevent infection with respiratory viruses.

A meta-analysis by the World Health Organization (WHO) in 2019 failed to show a substantial protective effect of face masks<sup>54</sup>. Similarly, another meta-analysis published in early 2020 showed that masks make no difference in preventing pandemic influenza in nonhealthcare settings<sup>55</sup>. A 2020 Cochrane meta-analysis of masks versus no masks in preventing viral respiratory illness found no difference in preventing influenza-like illness or laboratory confirmed



illness<sup>56</sup>. Therefore, when the analysis is limited to the strongest types of evidence (randomized trials and meta-analyses of randomized trials), there was no evidence prior to COVID-19 that healthy persons wearing masks in non-healthcare settings prevented the spread of respiratory tract infections.

## **ii. Evidence for cloth masks to prevent infection with respiratory viruses prior to COVID-19**

There was one randomized-controlled trial prior to 2020 comparing cloth masks to medical masks to prevent infection with respiratory viruses<sup>57</sup>. That study showed that risk of respiratory tract infection was significantly higher in hospital healthcare workers who wore cloth masks compared to hospital healthcare workers who wore medical masks.

## **iii. The rationale for masking healthy people in the community to prevent COVID-19**

Masks were recommended or mandated during the COVID-19 pandemic, not based on the evidence, but based on the precautionary principle. The WHO admitted in a December 2020 report that “there is only limited and inconsistent scientific evidence to support the effectiveness of masking of healthy people in the community to prevent infection with respiratory viruses, including SARS-CoV-2”<sup>58</sup>. That report recommends masking healthy people in the community to prevent COVID-19 based on the precautionary principle, that masks *might* prevent infection.

To justify its recommendation for masking healthy people in the community to prevent COVID-19 the WHO report cites many poor-quality studies. The poor-quality studies cited by the WHO have significant limitations that need to be considered. Many of the studies referenced by the WHO are ecological studies<sup>59</sup>, also called correlational studies. The ecological studies referenced by WHO compare mask use and COVID-19 rates between geographic region, such as country, state, or city. The descriptive analysis of these rates does not provide an evidentiary base for concluding causation. Ecological studies have “many methodologic problems that severely limit causal inference, including ecologic and cross-level bias, problems of confounder control, within-group misclassification, lack of adequate data, temporal ambiguity, collinearity, and migration across groups.”<sup>60</sup> The WHO report also acknowledges those studies “have important limitations to consider”<sup>61</sup>.

Cohort studies<sup>62</sup>, case control<sup>63</sup>, and case series<sup>64</sup> are all referenced in the WHO document, but these study types are considered much weaker than randomized controlled trials or meta-analysis. Due to the limitation of the study designs, particularly bias and confounding, the true effect of masking is uncertain. Many of these studies also have limited generalizability. For example, a study looking at secondary transmission of SARS-CoV-2 in households<sup>65</sup> has limited generalizability to universal masking in the wider general public. The findings from case series of persons who traveled on the same flight<sup>66</sup> cannot be generalized to universal masking.

Finally, a comment should be made on the study<sup>67</sup> by Chu et al. as that study is referenced by the WHO and has been widely cited in the media. That study putatively showed a large reduction in risk of infection with face mask use. As noted in a 2020 Cochrane review, the Chu et al. study

“has been criticised for several reasons: use of an outdated ‘Risk of bias’ tool; inaccuracy of distance measures; and not adequately addressing multiple sources of bias, including recall and classification bias and in particular confounding. Confounding is very likely, as preventive behaviours such as mask use, social distancing, and hand hygiene are correlated behaviours, and hence any effect estimates are likely to be overly optimistic.”<sup>68</sup>

#### **iv. Randomized controlled trials evaluating the benefit of masking of healthy people in the community to prevent SARS-CoV-2 infection**

Only two randomized controlled trials have been published during the COVID-19 pandemic evaluating the benefit of masking of healthy people in the community to prevent SARS-CoV-2 infection. The first study, conducted in Denmark in April and May 2020, was published in November 2020<sup>69</sup>. That study found there was no significant difference in SARS-CoV-2 infection rates between those who wore masks and those who did not wear masks.

A second study was conducted in Bangladesh between November 2020 and March 2021, and published in January 2022<sup>70</sup>.

Cloth masks: The study showed that cloth masks do not have any statistical effect on COVID-19 infection.

Medical (surgical) masks: The benefit of wearing a medical mask was very small. Based on the reported relative risk reduction of 11.1% with surgical masks and a symptomatic seropositivity in the control group of 0.76%, the number needed to treat (NNT) can be calculated to be 1,185. That means that 1,185 people need to wear a surgical mask for 8 weeks (the duration of the study) to prevent one infection. Alternatively, 182 people need to wear a surgical mask for one year to prevent one infection.

The NNT should be put in context. A NNT greater than 50 to prevent a symptomatic condition is considered very high, so a NNT of 182 (to prevent one COVID-19 case per year) is very high. The case fatality rate for COVID-19 is approximately 1%, so the NNT to prevent one COVID-19 death per year could be roughly estimated to be 18,200. A NNT > 1000 to prevent one death is considered very high, so a NNT of 18,200 (to prevent one COVID-19 death per year) is very high.

Hospitalizations and deaths: The study did not measure hospitalizations and deaths, so the effect of medical mask wearing to prevent COVID-19 deaths can only be estimated, as above. The study authors did their own estimates of the effect of medical mask wearing to prevent COVID-19 deaths and assumed that mask wearing would have no effect on mortality in those under age 50.

Vaccination: The study was performed before COVID-19 vaccinations were widely available, so it is expected that the effects of mask use in a vaccinated population would be even lower.

## **v. Adverse effects of mask wearing**

Healthy people in the community wearing cloth masks has no effect on COVID-19 transmission, and healthy people in the community wearing medical masks has a very small effect on COVID-19 transmission, so the potential adverse effects of wearing masks needs to be considered.

Wearing a face mask can cause retroauricular dermatitis<sup>71</sup>, ear deformities in children<sup>72</sup>, worsen acne<sup>73</sup>, cause itch<sup>74</sup>, jeopardises the ability of healthcare staff to successfully communicate with patients<sup>75</sup>. Wearing a mask in healthcare settings can limit empathy, trust and understanding between healthcare workers and patients<sup>76</sup> as well as increase cognitive load and listening effort for both patients and providers<sup>77</sup>. Wearing a face mask can increase blood carbon dioxide levels and decrease blood oxygen levels<sup>78</sup>. Face masks can compromise the capability to recognize the emotion on the basis of facial cues<sup>79</sup>, undermines trust in others<sup>80</sup>, impacts audiovisual word recognition in young children with hearing loss<sup>81</sup>, affect emotion recognition in individuals with autistic traits<sup>82</sup>, and reduce emotion-recognition accuracy and perceived closeness<sup>83</sup>.

It is well established that healthcare workers improperly removing (doffing) personal protective equipment (including masks) can be one of the highest risks for infectious disease transmission<sup>84</sup>. A person who is not a healthcare worker likely does not know how to properly wear and take off masks so there is a reasonable possibility that any (small) benefit of masking is negated by self-contamination by improper use and removal; however, there are no studies on the topic<sup>85</sup>.

## **vi. Conclusions**

Cloth masks: Before the COVID-19, it was known that cloth masks were inferior to medical masks in protecting healthcare workers from respiratory tract infections. The RCT performed in Bangladesh confirmed with a high degree of certainty that cloth masks are useless for preventing COVID-19 transmission. Despite this evidence, mask mandates in many jurisdictions in Canada have recommended cloth masks, essentially mandating a futile intervention.

Medical masks: Before the COVID-19, masking of healthy people in the community to prevent infection with respiratory viruses was known to be ineffective. Until the publication of the Bangladesh RCT, there was only “limited and inconsistent scientific evidence to support the effectiveness of masking of healthy people in the community to prevent”<sup>86</sup> COVID-19. The results of the Bangladesh RCT have showed that the benefit of medical masks is very small and likely limited to those over age 50. When considered in the context of possible harms of mask wearing as well as the inevitability of SARS-CoV-2 infection, the benefit of mask wearing can reasonably be considered transient and very small in the short term, and negligible in the long term.

## **B. Social distancing**

Almost all of the research done prior to 2020 examining the effectiveness of interventions such as avoiding crowding to control respiratory tract infections was done with influenza. Prior to 2020, social distancing was a term that included quarantine, school closures, work closures as well as avoiding crowding<sup>87</sup>.

As noted in a recent systemic review, “clear biological and epidemiologic rationale supports the potential effectiveness of social distancing measures”<sup>88</sup> in the control of viral respiratory tract infections; however, the actual evidence for avoiding crowding by the general public for the control of viral respiratory tract infections is negligible.

A 2019 WHO review<sup>89</sup> of non-pharmaceutical public health measures for mitigating the risk and impact of epidemic and pandemic influenza found only three studies<sup>90</sup> relevant to “avoiding crowding”. In all three studies the quality of evidence was rated as very low. Two of those studies were retrospective analysis of the 1918 pandemic<sup>91</sup>, both published in 2007. The limitations of studies done almost a century after an event should be self-evident, and hence the quality of that evidence is rated as very low. Importantly, in reference to “avoiding crowding” the WHO document notes<sup>92</sup>:

#### Ethical considerations

In urban locations it can be difficult to avoid crowding without considerable social costs.

Modification, postponement or cancellation of mass gatherings may have cultural or religious considerations, in addition to public health aspects.

#### Knowledge gaps

There are still major gaps in our understanding of person-to-person transmission dynamics. Reducing mass gatherings is likely to reduce transmission in the community, but the potential effects are difficult to predict with accuracy. Large-scale RCTs [randomized controlled trials] are unlikely to be feasible.

A 2020 Cochrane systematic review<sup>93</sup> “found only one RCT [randomized controlled trial] of quarantine, and no trials of screening at entry ports or physical distancing [emphasis added].” Since there is a complete absence of high-quality evidence regarding physical distancing, the authors state: “Physical distancing represents another major research gap which needs to be addressed expediently, especially within the context of the COVID-19 pandemic setting as well as in future epidemic settings.”<sup>93</sup>

It is estimated that 50% of Canadians were infected with SARS-CoV-2 during five months of the Omicron wave in early 2022<sup>94</sup>. Similarly, 66% of the Danish population aged 17-72 were estimated to have been infected between November 1, 2021, and March 15, 2022<sup>95</sup>. This means SARS-CoV-2 infection is pervasive and possibly inevitable.

In summary, while there is clear biological and epidemiological rationale for avoiding crowding, there is an absence of high-quality evidence, such as randomized-controlled trials, that prove the

effectiveness of avoiding crowding in particular groups or contexts, such as in outdoors settings. Like masking, the effect of social distancing on SARS-CoV-2 transmission can reasonably be considered transient and small in the short term, and negligible in the long term.

### C. Conclusion

The effect of masking or social distancing on the risk of COVID-19 transmission in outside settings needs to be considered in the following context, as detailed above but summarized here. SARS-CoV-2 infection is pervasive and can reasonably be considered inevitable. Over 50% of the populations of Canada and Denmark were infected with SARS-CoV-2 in a 4-5 month period. The transmission of any respiratory tract infection outdoors, including SARS-CoV-2, is low, and SARS-CoV-2 is known to be transmitted primarily indoors. Large outdoor gatherings of a relatively short duration do not result in an increased risk of COVID-19. The effect of mask wearing and social distancing on SARS-CoV-2 transmission, in general, is small and transient. In this context, it is reasonable to conclude that SARS-CoV-2 transmission in outside settings is not materially affected by masking or social distancing.

---

<sup>1</sup> Killerby ME, Biggs HM, Haynes A, Dahl RM, Mustaquim D, Gerber SI, Watson JT. Human coronavirus circulation in the United States 2014-2017. *J Clin Virol*. 2018 Apr;101:52-56.

Su S, Wong G, Shi W, Liu J, Lai ACK, Zhou J, Liu W, Bi Y, Gao GF. Epidemiology, Genetic Recombination, and Pathogenesis of Coronaviruses. *Trends Microbiol*. 2016 Jun;24(6):490-502.

<sup>2</sup> <https://www.who.int/publications/m/item/summary-of-probable-sars-cases-with-onset-of-illness-from-1-november-2002-to-31-july-2003>

<sup>3</sup> Dawson P, Malik MR, Parvez F, Morse SS. What Have We Learned About Middle East Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus Emergence in Humans? A Systematic Literature Review. *Vector Borne Zoonotic Dis*. 2019 Mar;19(3):174-192.

<sup>4</sup> [https://www.who.int/health-topics/middle-east-respiratory-syndrome-coronavirus-mers#tab=tab\\_1](https://www.who.int/health-topics/middle-east-respiratory-syndrome-coronavirus-mers#tab=tab_1)

<sup>5</sup> de Wit E, van Doremalen N, Falzarano D, Munster VJ. SARS and MERS: recent insights into emerging coronaviruses. *Nat Rev Microbiol*. 2016 Aug;14(8):523-34.

<sup>6</sup> Wang LF, Shi Z, Zhang S, Field H, Daszak P, Eaton BT. Review of bats and SARS. *Emerg Infect Dis*. 2006 Dec;12(12):1834-40.

Li W, Shi Z, Yu M, Ren W, Smith C, Epstein JH, Wang H, Crameri G, Hu Z, Zhang H, Zhang J, McEachern J, Field H, Daszak P, Eaton BT, Zhang S, Wang LF. Bats are natural reservoirs of SARS-like coronaviruses. *Science*. 2005 Oct 28;310(5748):676-9.

<sup>7</sup> Sah P, Fitzpatrick MC, Zimmer CF, Abdollahi E, Juden-Kelly L, Moghadas SM, Singer BH, Galvani AP. Asymptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infection: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A*. 2021 Aug 24;118(34):e2109229118. doi: 10.1073/pnas.2109229118.

Ma Q, Liu J, Liu Q, Kang L, Liu R, Jing W, Wu Y, Liu M. Global Percentage of Asymptomatic SARS-CoV-2 Infections Among the Tested Population and Individuals With Confirmed COVID-19 Diagnosis: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis. *JAMA Netw Open*. 2021 Dec 1;4(12):e2137257. doi:10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2021.37257.

<sup>8</sup> Berlin DA, Gulick RM, Martinez FJ. Severe Covid-19. *N Engl J Med*. 2020 Dec 17;383(25):2451-2460.

<sup>9</sup> Kasper MR, Geibe JR, Sears CL, Riegodedios AJ, Luse T, Von Thun AM, McGinnis MB, Olson N, Houskamp D, Fenequito R, Burgess TH, Armstrong AW, DeLong G, Hawkins RJ, Gillingham BL. An Outbreak of Covid-19 on an Aircraft Carrier. *N Engl J Med*. 2020 Dec 17;383(25):2417-2426.

<sup>10</sup> Jassat W, Abdool Karim SS, Mudara C, Welch R, Ozougwu L, Groome MJ, Govender N, von Gottberg A, Wolter N, Wolmarans M, Rousseau P; DATCOV author group, Blumberg L, Cohen C. Clinical severity of COVID-19 in

---

patients admitted to hospital during the omicron wave in South Africa: a retrospective observational study. *Lancet Glob Health*. 2022 Jul;10(7):e961-e969. doi: 10.1016/S2214-109X(22)00114-0. Epub 2022 May 18.

Wrenn JO, Pakala SB, Vestal G, Shilts MH, Brown HM, Bowen SM, Strickland BA, Williams T, Mallal SA, Jones ID, Schmitz JE, Self WH, Das SR. COVID-19 severity from Omicron and Delta SARS-CoV-2 variants. *Influenza Other Respir Viruses*. 2022 Sep;16(5):832-836. doi: 10.1111/irv.12982. Epub 2022 Apr 13.

<sup>11</sup> Killerby ME, Biggs HM, Haynes A, Dahl RM, Mustaqim D, Gerber SI, Watson JT. Human coronavirus circulation in the United States 2014-2017. *J Clin Virol*. 2018 Apr;101:52-56.

<sup>12</sup> Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19): Epidemiology update  
<https://health-infobase.canada.ca/covid-19/epidemiological-summary-covid-19-cases.html>

<sup>13</sup> Benedetti F, Pachetti M, Marini B, Ippodrino R, Gallo RC, Ciccozzi M, Zella D. Inverse correlation between average monthly high temperatures and COVID-19-related death rates in different geographical areas. *J Transl Med*. 2020 Jun 23;18(1):251.

Spada A, Tucci FA, Ummarino A, Ciavarella PP, Calà N, Troiano V, Caputo M, Ianzano R, Corbo S, de Biase M, Fascia N, Forte C, Gambacorta G, Maccione G, Prencipe G, Tomaiuolo M, Tucci A. Structural equation modeling to shed light on the controversial role of climate on the spread of SARS-CoV-2. *Sci Rep*. 2021 Apr 16;11(1):8358.

Castilla J, Fresán U, Trobajo-Sanmartín C, Guevara M. Altitude and SARS-CoV-2 Infection in the First Pandemic Wave in Spain. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2021 Mar 4;18(5):2578.

Afshordi N, Holder B, Bahrami M, Lichtblau D. Diverse local epidemics reveal the distinct effects of population density, demographics, climate, depletion of susceptibles, and intervention in the first wave of COVID-19 in the United States. <https://arxiv.org/pdf/2007.00159.pdf>

Riley P, Riley A, Turtle J, Ben-Nun M. COVID-19 Deaths: Which Explanatory Variables Matter the Most? <https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.06.11.20129007v1.abstract>

Coro G. A global-scale ecological niche model to predict SARS-CoV-2 coronavirus infection rate. *Ecol Modell*. 2020 Sep 1;431:109187.

Tzampoglou P, Loukidis D. Investigation of the Importance of Climatic Factors in COVID-19 Worldwide Intensity. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2020 Oct 22;17(21):7730.

Vantarakis A, Chatziprodromidou I, Apostolou T. COVID-19 and Environmental factors. PRISMA-compliant systematic review. <https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.05.10.20069732v1.abstract>

Pequeno P, Mendel B, Rosa C, Bosholn M, Souza JL, Baccaro F, Barbosa R, Magnusson W. Air transportation, population density and temperature predict the spread of COVID-19 in Brazil. *PeerJ*. 2020 Jun 3;8:e9322.

Liu J, Zhou J, Yao J, Zhang X, Li L, Xu X, He X, Wang B, Fu S, Niu T, Yan J, Shi Y, Ren X, Niu J, Zhu W, Li S, Luo B, Zhang K. Impact of meteorological factors on the COVID-19 transmission: A multi-city study in China. *Sci Total Environ*. 2020 Jul 15;726:138513.

Diao Y, Kodera S, Anzai D, Gomez-Tames J, Rashed EA, Hirata A. Influence of population density, temperature, and absolute humidity on spread and decay durations of COVID-19: A comparative study of scenarios in China, England, Germany, and Japan. *One Health*. 2020 Dec 11;12:100203.

Rashed EA, Kodera S, Gomez-Tames J, Hirata A. Influence of Absolute Humidity, Temperature and Population Density on COVID-19 Spread and Decay Durations: Multi-Prefecture Study in Japan. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2020 Jul 24;17(15):5354.

Byun WS, Heo SW, Jo G, Kim JW, Kim S, Lee S, Park HE, Baek JH. Is coronavirus disease (COVID-19) seasonal? A critical analysis of empirical and epidemiological studies at global and local scales. *Environ Res*. 2021 Mar 9;196:110972.

Xu R, Rahmandad H, Gupta M, DiGennaro C, Ghaffarzagdegan N, Amini H, Jalali MS. Weather, air pollution, and SARS-CoV-2 transmission: a global analysis. *Lancet Planet Health*. 2021 Oct;5(10):e671-e680. doi: 10.1016/S2542-5196(21)00202-3.

D'Amico F, Marmiere M, Righetti B, Scquizzato T, Zangrillo A, Puglisi R, Landoni G. COVID-19 seasonality in temperate countries. *Environ Res*. 2022 Apr 15;206:112614. doi: 10.1016/j.envres.2021.112614.

<sup>14</sup> Spada A, Tucci FA, Ummarino A, Ciavarella PP, Calà N, Troiano V, Caputo M, Ianzano R, Corbo S, de Biase M, Fascia N, Forte C, Gambacorta G, Maccione G, Prencipe G, Tomaiuolo M, Tucci A. Structural equation modeling to shed light on the controversial role of climate on the spread of SARS-CoV-2. *Sci Rep*. 2021 Apr 16;11(1):8358.

Castilla J, Fresán U, Trobajo-Sanmartín C, Guevara M. Altitude and SARS-CoV-2 Infection in the First Pandemic Wave in Spain. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2021 Mar 4;18(5):2578.

Afshordi N, Holder B, Bahrami M, Lichtblau D. Diverse local epidemics reveal the distinct effects of population density, demographics, climate, depletion of susceptibles, and intervention in the first wave of COVID-19 in the United States. <https://arxiv.org/pdf/2007.00159.pdf>

Riley P, Riley A, Turtle J, Ben-Nun M. COVID-19 Deaths: Which Explanatory Variables Matter the Most?

---

<https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.06.11.20129007v1.abstract>

Diao Y, Kodera S, Anzai D, Gomez-Tames J, Rashed EA, Hirata A. Influence of population density, temperature, and absolute humidity on spread and decay durations of COVID-19: A comparative study of scenarios in China, England, Germany, and Japan. *One Health*. 2020 Dec 11;12:100203.

Chen K, Li Z. The spread rate of SARS-CoV-2 is strongly associated with population density. *J Travel Med*. 2020 Dec 23;27(8)

Ives AR, Bozzuto C. Estimating and explaining the spread of COVID-19 at the county level in the USA. *Commun Biol*. 2021 Jan 5;4(1):60.

Sy KTL, White LF, Nichols BE. Population density and basic reproductive number of COVID-19 across United States counties. <https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.06.12.20130021v1.full.pdf>

Hass FS, Jokar Arsanjani J. The Geography of the Covid-19 Pandemic: A Data-Driven Approach to Exploring Geographical Driving Forces. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*.

Al-Gahtani, S., Shoukri, M. and Al-Eid, M. (2021) Predictors of the Aggregate of COVID-19 Cases and Its Case-Fatality: A Global Investigation Involving 120 Countries. *Open Journal of Statistics*, 11, 259-277.

<sup>15</sup> Rubin D, Huang J, Fisher BT, Gasparri A, Tam V, Song L, Wang X, Kaufman J, Fitzpatrick K, Jain A, Griffis H, Crammer K, Morris J, Tasian G. Association of Social Distancing, Population Density, and Temperature With the Instantaneous Reproduction Number of SARS-CoV-2 in Counties Across the United States. *JAMA Netw Open*. 2020 Jul 1;3(7):e2016099.

Anand S, Montez-Rath M, Han J, Bozeman J, Kerschmann R, Beyer P, Parsonnet J, Chertow GM. Prevalence of SARS-CoV-2 antibodies in a large nationwide sample of patients on dialysis in the USA: a cross-sectional study. *Lancet*. 2020 Sep 25;396(10259):1335-44.

<sup>16</sup> Garland P, Babbitt D, Bondarenko M, Sorichetta A, Tatem AJ, Johnson O. The COVID-19 pandemic as experienced by the individual. <https://arxiv.org/pdf/2005.01167.pdf>

<sup>17</sup> Ilardi A, Chieffi S, Iavarone A, Ilardi CR. SARS-CoV-2 in Italy: Population Density Correlates with Morbidity and Mortality. *Jpn J Infect Dis*. 2021 Jan 22;74(1):61-64.

<sup>18</sup> Malani A, Shah D, Kang G, Lobo GN, Shastri J, Mohanan M, Jain R, Agrawal S, Juneja S, Imad S, Kolthur-Seetharam U. Seroprevalence of SARS-CoV-2 in slums versus non-slums in Mumbai, India. *Lancet Glob Health*. 2021 Feb;9(2):e110-e111.

Bhadra A, Mukherjee A, Sarkar K. Impact of population density on Covid-19 infected and mortality rate in India. *Model Earth Syst Environ*. 2020 Oct 14:1-7.

<sup>19</sup> Macchia A, Ferrante D, Battistella G, Mariani J, González Bernaldo de Quirós F. COVID-19 among the inhabitants of the slums in the city of Buenos Aires: a population-based study. *BMJ Open*. 2021 Jan 20;11(1):e044592.

<sup>20</sup> Baser O. Population density index and its use for distribution of Covid-19: A case study using Turkish data. *Health Policy*. 2021 Feb;125(2):148-154.

<sup>21</sup> Kadi N, Khelfaoui M. Population density, a factor in the spread of COVID-19 in Algeria: statistic study. *Bull Natl Res Cent*. 2020;44(1):138.

<sup>22</sup> Pequeno P, Mendel B, Rosa C, Bosholn M, Souza JL, Baccaro F, Barbosa R, Magnusson W. Air transportation, population density and temperature predict the spread of COVID-19 in Brazil. *PeerJ*. 2020 Jun 3;8:e9322.

<sup>23</sup> 25. Rashed EA, Kodera S, Gomez-Tames J, Hirata A. Influence of Absolute Humidity, Temperature and Population Density on COVID-19 Spread and Decay Durations: Multi-Prefecture Study in Japan. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2020 Jul 24;17(15):5354.

<sup>24</sup> Copiello S, Grillenzoni C. The spread of 2019-nCoV in China was primarily driven by population density. Comment on "Association between short-term exposure to air pollution and COVID-19 infection: Evidence from China" by Zhu et al. *Sci Total Environ*. 2020 Nov 20;744:141028.

<sup>25</sup> Williamson EJ, Walker AJ, Bhaskaran K, Bacon S, Bates C, Morton CE, Curtis HJ, Mehrkar A, Evans D, Inglesby P, Cockburn J, McDonald HI, MacKenna B, Tomlinson L, Douglas IJ, Rentsch CT, Mathur R, Wong AYS, Grieve R, Harrison D, Forbes H, Schultze A, Croker R, Parry J, Hester F, Harper S, Perera R, Evans SJW, Smeeth L, Goldacre B. Factors associated with COVID-19-related death using OpenSAFELY. *Nature*. 2020 Aug;584(7821):430-436.

<sup>26</sup> Verity R, Okell LC, Dorigatti I, Winskill P, Whittaker C, Imai N, Cuomo-Dannenburg G, Thompson H, Walker PGT, Fu H, Dighe A, Griffin JT, Baguelin M, Bhatia S, Boonyasiri A, Cori A, Cucunubá Z, FitzJohn R, Gaythorpe K, Green W, Hamlet A, Hinsley W, Laydon D, Nedjati-Gilani G, Riley S, van Elsland S, Volz E, Wang H, Wang Y, Xi X, Donnelly CA, Ghani AC, Ferguson NM. Estimates of the severity of coronavirus disease 2019: a model-based analysis. *Lancet Infect Dis*. 2020 Jun;20(6):669-677.

- 
- <sup>27</sup> Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19): Epidemiology update  
<https://health-infobase.canada.ca/covid-19/epidemiological-summary-covid-19-cases.html> (accessed March 25, 2022)
- <sup>28</sup> Ioannidis JPA, Axfors C, Contopoulos-Ioannidis DG. Population-level COVID-19 mortality risk for non-elderly individuals overall and for non-elderly individuals without underlying diseases in pandemic epicenters. *Environ Res.* 2020 Sep;188:109890.
- <sup>29</sup> Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19): Epidemiology update  
<https://health-infobase.canada.ca/covid-19/epidemiological-summary-covid-19-cases.html>  
<https://tc.canada.ca/en/road-transportation/motor-vehicle-safety/canadian-motor-vehicle-traffic-collision-statistics-2018>
- <sup>30</sup> Islam N, Shkolnikov VM, Acosta RJ, Klimkin I, Kawachi I, Irizarry RA, Alicandro G, Khunti K, Yates T, Jdanov DA, White M, Lewington S, Lacey B. Excess deaths associated with covid-19 pandemic in 2020: age and sex disaggregated time series analysis in 29 high income countries. *BMJ.* 2021 May 19;373:n1137. doi: 10.1136/bmj.n1137.  
Staub K, Panczak R, Matthes KL, Floris J, Berlin C, Junker C, Weitkunat R, Mamelund SE, Zwahlen M, Riou J. Historically High Excess Mortality During the COVID-19 Pandemic in Switzerland, Sweden, and Spain. *Ann Intern Med.* 2022 Feb 1:M21-3824. doi: 10.7326/M21-3824.  
Sempé L, Lloyd-Sherlock P, Martínez R, Ebrahim S, McKee M, Acosta E. Estimation of all-cause excess mortality by age-specific mortality patterns for countries with incomplete vital statistics: a population-based study of the case of Peru during the first wave of the COVID-19 pandemic. *Lancet Reg Health Am.* 2021 Oct;2:None. doi: 10.1016/j.lana.2021.100039.
- <sup>31</sup> Taniguchi Y, Kuno T, Komiyama J, Adomi M, Suzuki T, Abe T, Ishimaru M, Miyawaki A, Saito M, Ohbe H, Miyamoto Y, Imai S, Kamio T, Tamiya N, Iwagami M. Comparison of patient characteristics and in-hospital mortality between patients with COVID-19 in 2020 and those with influenza in 2017-2020: a multicenter, retrospective cohort study in Japan. *Lancet Reg Health West Pac.* 2022 Mar;20:100365. doi: 10.1016/j.lanwpc.2021.100365.  
Staub K, Panczak R, Matthes KL, Floris J, Berlin C, Junker C, Weitkunat R, Mamelund SE, Zwahlen M, Riou J. Historically High Excess Mortality During the COVID-19 Pandemic in Switzerland, Sweden, and Spain. *Ann Intern Med.* 2022 Feb 1:M21-3824. doi: 10.7326/M21-3824.
- <sup>32</sup> Hobday R, Collignon P. An Old Defence Against New Infections: The Open-Air Factor and COVID-19. *Cureus.* 2022 Jun 20;14(6):e26133. doi: 10.7759/cureus.26133.
- <sup>33</sup> Chapter 12. Canadian Tuberculosis Standards, 7th edition. Public Health Agency of Canada. 2014.
- <sup>34</sup> Chapter 15. Canadian Tuberculosis Standards, 7th edition. Public Health Agency of Canada. 2014.
- <sup>35</sup> Chapter 2. Canadian Tuberculosis Standards, 7th edition. Public Health Agency of Canada. 2014.
- <sup>36</sup> Rainey JJ, Phelps T, Shi J. Mass Gatherings and Respiratory Disease Outbreaks in the United States - Should We Be Worried? Results from a Systematic Literature Review and Analysis of the National Outbreak Reporting System. *PLoS One.* 2016 Aug 18;11(8):e0160378.
- <sup>37</sup> Botelho-Nevers E, Gautret P. Outbreaks associated to large open air festivals, including music festivals, 1980 to 2012. *Euro Surveill.* 2013 Mar 14;18(11):20426.
- <sup>38</sup> Bulfone TC, Malekinejad M, Rutherford GW, Razani N. Outdoor Transmission of SARS-CoV-2 and Other Respiratory Viruses: A Systematic Review. *J Infect Dis.* 2021 Feb 24;223(4):550-561.
- <sup>39</sup> Bhatt M, Plint AC, Tang K, Malley R, Huy AP, McGahern C, Dawson J, Pelchat M, Dawson L, Varshney T, Arnold C, Galipeau Y, Austin M, Thampi N, Alnaji F, Langlois MA, Zemek RL. Household transmission of SARS-CoV-2 from unvaccinated asymptomatic and symptomatic household members with confirmed SARS-CoV-2 infection: an antibody-surveillance study. *CMAJ Open.* 2022 Apr 12;10(2):E357-E366. doi: 10.9778/cmajo.20220026.
- <sup>40</sup> Choi A, Mâsse LC, Bardwell S, Kayda I, Zhao Y, Xu YXZ, Markarian A, Coombs D, Macdonald A, Watts AW, Dhillon N, Irvine M, O'Reilly C, Lavoie PM, Goldfarb DM. Symptomatic and Asymptomatic Transmission of SARS-CoV-2 in K-12 Schools, British Columbia, Canada April to June 2021. *Microbiol Spectr.* 2022 Jul 6:e0062222. doi: 10.1128/spectrum.00622-22.
- <sup>41</sup> Toth DJA, Beams AB, Keegan LT, Zhang Y, Greene T, Orleans B, Seegert N, Looney A, Alder SC, Samore MH. High variability in transmission of SARS-CoV-2 within households and implications for control. *PLoS One.* 2021 Nov 10;16(11):e0259097. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0259097.
- <sup>42</sup> Bi Q, Lessler J, Eckerle I, Lauer SA, Kaiser L, Vuilleumier N, Cummings DAT, Flahault A, Petrovic D, Guessous I, Stringhini S, Azman AS; SEROCov-POP Study Group. Insights into household transmission of SARS-CoV-2



---

from a population-based serological survey. *Nat Commun.* 2021 Jun 15;12(1):3643. doi: 10.1038/s41467-021-23733-5.

<sup>43</sup> World Health Organization. Report of the WHO-China Joint Mission on Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19). <https://www.who.int/docs/default-source/coronaviruse/who-china-joint-mission-on-covid-19-final-report.pdf>

<sup>44</sup> Bi Q, Wu Y, Mei S, Ye C, Zou X, Zhang Z, Liu X, Wei L, Truelove SA, Zhang T, Gao W, Cheng C, Tang X, Wu X, Wu Y, Sun B, Huang S, Sun Y, Zhang J, Ma T, Lessler J, Feng T. Epidemiology and transmission of COVID-19 in 391 cases and 1286 of their close contacts in Shenzhen, China: a retrospective cohort study. *Lancet Infect Dis.* 2020 Aug;20(8):911-919.

<sup>45</sup> Public Health Agency of Canada. CANADA COVID-19 WEEKLY EPIDEMIOLOGY REPORT. <https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/phac-aspc/documents/services/diseases/2019-novel-coronavirus-infection/surv-covid19-weekly-epi-update-20220325-en.pdf>

<sup>46</sup> Bulfone TC, Blat C, Chen YH, Rutherford GW, Gutierrez-Mock L, Nickerson A, Buback L, Welty S, Sokal-Gutierrez K, Enanoria WTA, Reid MJA. Outdoor Activities Associated with Lower Odds of SARS-CoV-2 Acquisition: A Case-Control Study. *Int J Environ Res Public Health.* 2022 May 18;19(10):6126. doi: 10.3390/ijerph19106126.

<sup>47</sup> Venter ZS, Sadilek A, Stanton C, Barton DN, Aunan K, Chowdhury S, Schneider A, Iacus SM. Mobility in Blue-Green Spaces Does Not Predict COVID-19 Transmission: A Global Analysis. *Int J Environ Res Public Health.* 2021 Nov 29;18(23):12567. doi: 10.3390/ijerph182312567.

<sup>48</sup> Qian H, Miao T, Liu L, Zheng X, Luo D, Li Y. Indoor transmission of SARS-CoV-2. *Indoor Air.* 2020 Oct 31.

<sup>49</sup> Li Y, Cheng P, Jia W. Poor ventilation worsens short-range airborne transmission of respiratory infection. *Indoor Air.* 2022 Jan;32(1):e12946. doi: 10.1111/ina.12946.

<sup>50</sup> Dinoi A, Feltracco M, Chirizzi D, Trabucco S, Conte M, Gregoris E, Barbaro E, La Bella G, Ciccarese G, Belosi F, La Salandra G, Gambaro A, Contini D. A review on measurements of SARS-CoV-2 genetic material in air in outdoor and indoor environments: Implication for airborne transmission. *Sci Total Environ.* 2022 Feb 25;809:151137. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.151137.

<sup>51</sup> Suñer C, Coma E, Ouchi D, Hermosilla E, Baro B, Rodríguez-Arias MÀ, Puig J, Clotet B, Medina M, Mitjà O. Association between two mass-gathering outdoor events and incidence of SARS-CoV-2 infections during the fifth wave of COVID-19 in north-east Spain: A population-based control-matched analysis. *Lancet Reg Health Eur.* 2022 Feb 28;15:100337. doi: 10.1016/j.lanpe.2022.100337.

<sup>52</sup> Drakesmith M, Hobson G, John G, Stegall E, Gould A, Parkinson J, Thomas DR. Developing a population data science approach to assess increased risk of COVID-19 associated with attending large events. *Int J Popul Data Sci.* 2022 Jun 6;6(3):1711. doi: 10.23889/ijpds.v5i4.1711.

<sup>53</sup> Toumi A, Zhao H, Chhatwal J, Linas BP, Ayer T. Association of Limited In-Person Attendance in US National Football League and National Collegiate Athletic Association Games With County-Level COVID-19 Cases. *JAMA Netw Open.* 2021 Aug 2;4(8):e2119621. doi: 10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2021.19621.

<sup>54</sup> Non-pharmaceutical public health measures for mitigating the risk and impact of epidemic and pandemic influenza; 2019 <https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/329439/WHO-WHE-IHM-GIP-2019.1-eng.pdf> (accessed January 28, 2021)

<sup>55</sup> Xiao J, Shiu EYC, Gao H, Wong JY, Fong MW, Ryu S, Cowling BJ. Nonpharmaceutical measures for pandemic influenza in nonhealthcare settings - personal protective and environmental measures. *Emerging Infectious Diseases* 2020;26(5):967-75.

<sup>56</sup> Jefferson T DMC, Dooley L, Ferroni E, Al-Ansary LA, Bawazeer GA, et al. Physical interventions to interrupt or reduce the spread of respiratory viruses. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews* 2020;(11):CD006207.

<sup>57</sup> MacIntyre CR, Seale H, Dung TC, Hien NT, Nga PT, Chughtai AA, Rahman B, Dwyer DE, Wang Q. A cluster randomised trial of cloth masks compared with medical masks in healthcare workers. *BMJ Open.* 2015 Apr 22;5(4):e006577. doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2014-006577.

<sup>58</sup> World Health Organization. Mask use in the context of COVID-19. Interim guidance. 1 December 2020. WHO reference number: WHO/2019-nCoV/IPC\_Masks/2020.5 [https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/advice-on-the-use-of-masks-in-the-community-during-home-care-and-in-healthcare-settings-in-the-context-of-the-novel-coronavirus-\(2019-ncov\)-outbreak](https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/advice-on-the-use-of-masks-in-the-community-during-home-care-and-in-healthcare-settings-in-the-context-of-the-novel-coronavirus-(2019-ncov)-outbreak)

<sup>59</sup> Chiang CH, Chiang CH, Chiang CH, Chen YC. The Practice of Wearing Surgical Masks during the COVID-19 Pandemic. *Emerg Infect Dis.* 2020;26(8):1962.

Cheng VC, Wong SC, Chuang VW, So SY, Chen JH, Sridhar S, et al. The role of community-wide wearing of face mask for control of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) epidemic due to SARS-CoV-2. *J Infect.* 2020;81(1):107-14.

---

Bo Y, Guo C, Lin C, et al. Effectiveness of non-pharmaceutical interventions on COVID-19 transmission in 190 countries from 23 January to 13 April 2020. *Int J Infect Dis.* 2020; 102: 247–253.

Lyu W, Wehby GL. Community Use Of Face Masks And COVID-19: Evidence From A Natural Experiment Of State Mandates In The US. *Health Aff (Millwood).* 2020;39(8):1419-25.

Gallaway MS, Rigler J, Robinson S, Herrick K, Livar E, Komatsu KK, et al. Trends in COVID-19 Incidence After Implementation of Mitigation Measures - Arizona, January 22-August 7, 2020. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep.* 2020;69(40):1460-3.

Rader B, White LF, Burns MR, Chen J, Brilliant J, Cohen J, et al. Mask Wearing and Control of SARS-CoV-2 Transmission in the United States. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.08.23.20078964.

Matzinger P, Skinner J. Strong impact of closing schools, closing bars and wearing masks during the Covid-19 pandemic: results from a simple and revealing analysis. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.09.26.20202457.

Kenyon C. Widespread use of face masks in public may slow the spread of SARS CoV-2: 1 an ecological study. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.03.31.20048652.

Leffler CT, Ing E, Lykins JD, Hogan MC, McKeown CA, Grzybowski A. Association of Country- wide Coronavirus Mortality with Demographics, Testing, Lockdowns, and Public Wearing of Masks. *Am J Trop Med Hyg.* 2020. doi: 10.4269/ajtmh.20-1015.

Lan F-Y, Christophi C, Buley J, Lliaki E, Bruno-Murtha L, Sayah A, et al. Effects of universal masking on Massachusetts healthcare workers' COVID-19 incidence. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.08.09.20171173.

Aravindakshan A, Boehnke J, Gholami E, Nayak A. Mask-Wearing During the COVID-19 Pandemic. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.09.11.20192971.

Pletz M, Steiner A, Kesselmeier M, Loeffler B, Trommer S, Weis S, et al. Impact of universal masking in health care and community on SARS-CoV-2 spread. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.09.02.20187021.

Fortaleza C, et al. Impact of nonpharmaceutical governmental strategies for prevention and control of COVID-19 in São Paulo State, Brazil. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.08.23.20180273.

Karaivanov A, Lu SE, Shigeoka H, Chen C, Pamplona S. Face Masks, Public Policies and Slowing the Spread of COVID-19: Evidence from Canada. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.09.24.20201178.

Miyazawa D, Kaneko G. Face mask wearing rate predicts country's COVID-19 death rates: with supplementary state-by-state data in the United States. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.06.22.20137745.

Mitze T, Kosfeld R, Rode J, Walde K. Face Masks Considerably Reduce Covid-19 Cases in Germany. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.06.21.20128181.

Maloney M, Rhodes N, Yarnold P. Mask mandates can limit COVID spread: Quantitative assessment of month-over-month effectiveness of governmental policies in reducing the number of new COVID- 19 cases in 37 US States and the District of Columbia. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.10.06.20208033.

Sruthi C, Biswal M, Saraswat B, Joshi H, Prakash M. How Policies on Restaurants, Bars, Nightclubs, Masks, Schools, and Travel Influenced Swiss COVID-19 Reproduction Ratios. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.10.11.20210641.

Shacham e, Scroggins S, Ellis M, Garza A. Association of County-Wide Mask Ordinances with Reductions in Daily CoVID-19 Incident Case Growth in a Midwestern Region Over 12 Weeks. *MedRxiv.* 2020. doi: 10.1101/2020.10.28.20221705.

Chernozhukov V, Kasahara H, Schrimpf P. Causal Impact of Masks, Policies, Behavior on Early Covid-19 Pandemic in the U.S. *J Econom.* 2020. doi: 10.1016/j.jeconom.2020.09.003.

Research GS. Face Masks and GDP. 2020. (<https://www.goldmansachs.com/insights/pages/face-masks-and-gdp.html> accessed 21 November 2020).

Scott N, Saul A, Spelman T, Stoove M, Pedrana A, Saeri A. The introduction of a mandatory mask policy was associated with significantly reduced COVID-19 cases in a major metropolitan city. 2020. (Available at SSRN:<http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3714648> accessed 29 November 2020).

<sup>60</sup> Morgenstern H. Ecologic studies in epidemiology: concepts, principles, and methods. *Annu Rev Public Health.* 1995;16:61-81.

<sup>61</sup> World Health Organization. Mask use in the context of COVID-19. Interim guidance. 1 December 2020. WHO reference number: WHO/2019-nCoV/IPC\_Masks/2020.5 [https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/advice-on-the-use-of-masks-in-the-community-during-home-care-and-in-healthcare-settings-in-the-context-of-the-novel-coronavirus-\(2019-ncov\)-outbreak](https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/advice-on-the-use-of-masks-in-the-community-during-home-care-and-in-healthcare-settings-in-the-context-of-the-novel-coronavirus-(2019-ncov)-outbreak)

Piantadosi S, Byar DP, Green SB. The ecological fallacy. *Am J Epidemiol.* 1988;127(5):893-904.

Clifford GD, Long WJ, Moody GB, Szolovits P. Robust parameter extraction for decision support using multimodal intensive care data. *Philos Trans A Math Phys Eng Sci.* 2009 Jan 28; 367(1887): 411–429.

- 
- Dufault B, Klar N. The quality of modern cross-sectional ecologic studies: a bibliometric review. *Am J Epidemiol*. 2011;174(10):1101-7.
- <sup>62</sup> Wang Y, Tian H, Zhang L, Zhang M, Guo D, Wu W, et al. Reduction of secondary transmission of SARS-CoV-2 in households by face mask use, disinfection and social distancing: a cohort study in Beijing, China. *BMJ Glob Health*. 2020; 5(5): e002794.
- <sup>63</sup> Doung-ngern P, Suphanchaimat R, Panjangampathana A, Janekrongtham C, Ruampoom D, Daochaeng N. Associations between mask-wearing, handwashing, and social distancing practices and risk of COVID-19 infection in public: a case-control study in Thailand. *Emerg Infect Dis*. 2020;26(11):2607-2616.
- Lau JT, Tsui H, Lau M, Yang X. SARS transmission, risk factors, and prevention in Hong Kong. *Emerg Infect Dis*. 2004;10(4):587-92.
- Wu J, Xu F, Zhou W, Feikin DR, Lin CY, He X, et al. Risk factors for SARS among persons without known contact with SARS patients, Beijing, China. *Emerg Infect Dis*. 2004;10(2):210-6.
- <sup>64</sup> Chen J, He H, Cheng W. Potential transmission of SARS-CoV-2 on a flight from Singapore to Hangzhou, China: An epidemiological investigation. *Travel Med Infect Dis*. 2020; 36: 101816.
- Schwartz KL, Murti M, Finkelstein M, Leis JA, Fitzgerald-Husek A, Bourns L, et al. Lack of COVID-19 transmission on an international flight. *CMAJ*.
- Hendrix MJ, Walde C, Findley K, Trotman R. Absence of Apparent Transmission of SARS-CoV-2 from Two Stylists After Exposure at a Hair Salon with a Universal Face Covering Policy - Springfield, Missouri, May 2020. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep*. 2020;69(28):930-2.
- <sup>65</sup> Wang Y, Tian H, Zhang L, Zhang M, Guo D, Wu W, et al. Reduction of secondary transmission of SARS-CoV-2 in households by face mask use, disinfection and social distancing: a cohort study in Beijing, China. *BMJ Glob Health*. 2020; 5(5): e002794.
- <sup>66</sup> Chen J, He H, Cheng W. Potential transmission of SARS-CoV-2 on a flight from Singapore to Hangzhou, China: An epidemiological investigation. *Travel Med Infect Dis*. 2020; 36: 101816.
- Schwartz KL, Murti M, Finkelstein M, Leis JA, Fitzgerald-Husek A, Bourns L, et al. Lack of COVID-19 transmission on an international flight. *CMAJ*.
- <sup>67</sup> Chu DK, Akl EA, Duda S, Solo K, Yaacoub S, Schünemann HJ; COVID-19 Systematic Urgent Review Group Effort (SURGE) study authors. Physical distancing, face masks, and eye protection to prevent person-to-person transmission of SARS-CoV-2 and COVID-19: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Lancet*. 2020 Jun 27;395(10242):1973-1987.
- <sup>68</sup> Jefferson T DMC, Dooley L, Ferroni E, Al-Ansary LA, Bawazeer GA, et al. Physical interventions to interrupt or reduce the spread of respiratory viruses. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews* 2020;(11):CD006207.
- <sup>69</sup> Bundgaard H, J. B, Raaschou-Pedersen D, von Buchwald C, Todsén T, Norsk J. Effectiveness of Adding a Mask Recommendation to Other Public Health Measures to Prevent SARS-CoV-2 Infection in Danish Mask Wearers. *Ann Intern Med*. 2020.
- <sup>70</sup> Abaluck J, Kwong LH, Styczynski A, Haque A, Kabir MA, Bates-Jefferys E, Crawford E, Benjamin-Chung J, Raihan S, Rahman S, Benhachmi S, Binteé NZ, Winch PJ, Hossain M, Reza HM, Jaber AA, Momen SG, Rahman A, Banti FL, Huq TS, Luby SP, Mobarak AM. Impact of community masking on COVID-19: A cluster-randomized trial in Bangladesh. *Science*. 2022 Jan 14;375(6577):eabi9069. doi: 10.1126/science.abi9069.
- <sup>71</sup> Bothra A, Das S, Singh M, Pawar M, Maheswari A. Retroauricular dermatitis with vehement use of ear loop face masks during COVID-19 pandemic. *J Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol*. 2020 Oct;34(10):e549-e552. doi:10.1111/jdv.16692.
- <sup>72</sup> Zanotti B, Parodi PC, Riccio M, De Francesco F, Zingaretti N. Can the Elastic of Surgical Face Masks Stimulate Ear Protrusion in Children? *Aesthetic Plast Surg*. 2020 Oct;44(5):1947-1950. doi: 10.1007/s00266-020-01833-9.
- <sup>73</sup> Techasatian L, Lebsing S, Uppala R, Thaowandee W, Chaiyarit J, Supakunpinyo C, Panombualert S, Mairiang D, Saengnipanthkul S, Wichajarn K, Kiatchoosakun P, Kosalaraksa P. The Effects of the Face Mask on the Skin Underneath: A Prospective Survey During the COVID-19 Pandemic. *J Prim Care Community Health*. 2020 Jan-Dec;11:2150132720966167. doi: 10.1177/2150132720966167.
- <sup>74</sup> Szepietowski JC, Matusiak Ł, Szepietowska M, Krajewski PK, Białynicki-Birula R. Face Mask-induced Itch: A Self-questionnaire Study of 2,315 Responders During the COVID-19 Pandemic. *Acta Derm Venereol*. 2020 May 28;100(10):adv00152. doi: 10.2340/00015555-3536.
- <sup>75</sup> Marler H, Ditton A. "I'm smiling back at you": Exploring the impact of mask wearing on communication in healthcare. *Int J Lang Commun Disord*. 2021 Jan;56(1):205-214. doi: 10.1111/1460-6984.12578.
- <sup>76</sup> Kratzke IM, Rosenbaum ME, Cox C, Ollila DW, Kapadia MR. Effect of Clear vs Standard Covered Masks on Communication With Patients During Surgical Clinic Encounters: A Randomized Clinical Trial. *JAMA Surg*. 2021 Apr 1;156(4):372-378. doi: 10.1001/jamasurg.2021.0836.

- 
- <sup>77</sup> Lee E, Cormier K, Sharma A. Face mask use in healthcare settings: effects on communication, cognition, listening effort and strategies for amelioration. *Cogn Res Princ Implic*. 2022 Jan 10;7(1):2. doi: 10.1186/s41235-021-00353-7.
- <sup>78</sup> Kisielinski K, Giboni P, Prescher A, Klosterhalfen B, Graessel D, Funken S, Kempfski O, Hirsch O. Is a Mask That Covers the Mouth and Nose Free from Undesirable Side Effects in Everyday Use and Free of Potential Hazards? *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2021 Apr 20;18(8):4344. doi: 10.3390/ijerph18084344.
- <sup>79</sup> Marini M, Ansani A, Paglieri F, Caruana F, Viola M. The impact of facemasks on emotion recognition, trust attribution and re-identification. *Sci Rep*. 2021 Mar 10;11(1):5577. doi: 10.1038/s41598-021-84806-5.
- <sup>80</sup> Malik S, Mihm B, Reichelt M. The impact of face masks on interpersonal trust in times of COVID-19. *Sci Rep*. 2021 Aug 30;11(1):17369. doi: 10.1038/s41598-021-96500-7.
- <sup>81</sup> Lipps E, Caldwell-Kurtzman J, Motlagh-Zadeh L, Blankenship CM, Moor DR, Hunter LL. Impact of Face Masks on Audiovisual Word Recognition in Young Children with Hearing Loss During the Covid-19 Pandemic. *The Journal of Early Hearing Detection and Intervention*. 2021; 6(2):70-79. <https://doi.org/10.26077/4fda-c155>
- <sup>82</sup> Pazhoohi F, Forby L, Kingstone A. Facial masks affect emotion recognition in the general population and individuals with autistic traits. *PLoS One*. 2021 Sep 30;16(9):e0257740. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0257740.
- <sup>83</sup> Grundmann F, Epstude K, Scheibe S. Face masks reduce emotion-recognition accuracy and perceived closeness. *PLoS One*. 2021 Apr 23;16(4):e0249792. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0249792.
- <sup>84</sup> Okamoto K, Rhee Y, Schoeny M, Lolans K, Cheng J, Reddy S, Weinstein RA, Hayden MK, Popovich KJ; Centers for Disease Control and Prevention Epicenters Program. Impact of doffing errors on healthcare worker self-contamination when caring for patients on contact precautions. *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol*. 2019 May;40(5):559-565. doi: 10.1017/ice.2019.33.
- Casanova LM, Erukunakpor K, Kraft CS, Mumma JM, Durso FT, Ferguson AN, Gipson CL, Walsh VL, Zimring C, DuBose J, Jacob JT; Centers for Disease Control and Prevention Epicenters Program, Division of Healthcare Quality Promotion. Assessing Viral Transfer During Doffing of Ebola-Level Personal Protective Equipment in a Biocontainment Unit. *Clin Infect Dis*. 2018 Mar 5;66(6):945-949. doi: 10.1093/cid/cix956.
- Mumma JM, Durso FT, Ferguson AN, Gipson CL, Casanova L, Erukunakpor K, Kraft CS, Walsh VL, Zimring C, DuBose J, Jacob JT; Centers for Disease Control and Prevention Epicenters Program, Division of Healthcare Quality Promotion. Human Factors Risk Analyses of a Doffing Protocol for Ebola-Level Personal Protective Equipment: Mapping Errors to Contamination. *Clin Infect Dis*. 2018 Mar 5;66(6):950-958. doi: 10.1093/cid/cix957.
- Suen LKP, Guo YP, Tong DWK, Leung PHM, Lung D, Ng MSP, Lai TKH, Lo KYK, Au-Yeung CH, Yu W. Self-contamination during doffing of personal protective equipment by healthcare workers to prevent Ebola transmission. *Antimicrob Resist Infect Control*. 2018 Dec 22;7:157. doi: 10.1186/s13756-018-0433-y.
- Chughtai AA, Chen X, Macintyre CR. Risk of self-contamination during doffing of personal protective equipment. *Am J Infect Control*. 2018 Dec;46(12):1329-1334. doi: 10.1016/j.ajic.2018.06.003.
- Mumma JM, Durso FT, Casanova LM, Erukunakpor K, Kraft CS, Ray SM, Shane AL, Walsh VL, Shah PY, Zimring C, DuBose J, Jacob JT. Common Behaviors and Faults When Doffing Personal Protective Equipment for Patients With Serious Communicable Diseases. *Clin Infect Dis*. 2019 Sep 13;69(Suppl 3):S214-S220. doi: 10.1093/cid/ciz614.
- Baloh J, Reisinger HS, Dukes K, da Silva JP, Salehi HP, Ward M, Chasco EE, Pennathur PR, Herwaldt L. Healthcare Workers' Strategies for Doffing Personal Protective Equipment. *Clin Infect Dis*. 2019 Sep 13;69(Suppl 3):S192-S198. doi: 10.1093/cid/ciz613.
- <sup>85</sup> Bakhit M, Krzyzaniak N, Scott AM, Clark J, Glasziou P, Del Mar C. Downsides of face masks and possible mitigation strategies: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMJ Open*. 2021 Feb 22;11(2):e044364. doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2020-044364.
- <sup>86</sup> World Health Organization. Mask use in the context of COVID-19. Interim guidance. 1 December 2020. WHO reference number: WHO/2019-nCoV/IPC\_Masks/2020.5 [https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/advice-on-the-use-of-masks-in-the-community-during-home-care-and-in-healthcare-settings-in-the-context-of-the-novel-coronavirus-\(2019-ncov\)-outbreak](https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/advice-on-the-use-of-masks-in-the-community-during-home-care-and-in-healthcare-settings-in-the-context-of-the-novel-coronavirus-(2019-ncov)-outbreak)
- <sup>87</sup> Non-pharmaceutical public health measures for mitigating the risk and impact of epidemic and pandemic influenza; 2019 <https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/329439/WHO-WHE-IHM-GIP-2019.1-eng.pdf>
- <sup>88</sup> Fong MW, Gao H, Wong JY, Xiao J, Shiu EYC, Ryu S, Cowling BJ. Nonpharmaceutical Measures for Pandemic Influenza in Nonhealthcare Settings - Social Distancing Measures. *Emerg Infect Dis*. 2020 May;26(5):976-984.
- <sup>89</sup> Non-pharmaceutical public health measures for mitigating the risk and impact of epidemic and pandemic influenza; 2019 <https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/329439/WHO-WHE-IHM-GIP-2019.1-eng.pdf>

---

<sup>90</sup> Hatchett RJ, Mecher CE, Lipsitch M. Public health interventions and epidemic intensity during the 1918 influenza pandemic. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A*. 2007;104(18):7582–7.

Markel H, Lipman HB, Navarro JA, Sloan A, Michalsen JR, Stern AM et al. Nonpharmaceutical interventions implemented by US cities during the 1918-1919 influenza pandemic. *JAMA*. 2007;298(6):644–54.

Staff M, Torres MI. An influenza outbreak among pilgrims sleeping at a school without purpose built overnight accommodation facilities. *Commun Dis Intell Q Rep*. 2011;35(1):10–5.

<sup>91</sup> Hatchett RJ, Mecher CE, Lipsitch M. Public health interventions and epidemic intensity during the 1918 influenza pandemic. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A*. 2007;104(18):7582–7.

Markel H, Lipman HB, Navarro JA, Sloan A, Michalsen JR, Stern AM et al. Nonpharmaceutical interventions implemented by US cities during the 1918-1919 influenza pandemic. *JAMA*. 2007;298(6):644–54.

<sup>92</sup> Non-pharmaceutical public health measures for mitigating the risk and impact of epidemic and pandemic influenza; 2019 <https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/329439/WHO-WHE-IHM-GIP-2019.1-eng.pdf>

<sup>93</sup> Jefferson T DMC, Dooley L, Ferroni E, Al-Ansary LA, Bawazeer GA, et al. Physical interventions to interrupt or reduce the spread of respiratory viruses. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews* 2020;(11):CD006207.

<sup>94</sup> [https://www.covid19immunitytaskforce.ca/wp-content/uploads/2022/07/CITF\\_Bespoke-report\\_Omicron-tsunami\\_2022\\_FINAL\\_ENG.pdf](https://www.covid19immunitytaskforce.ca/wp-content/uploads/2022/07/CITF_Bespoke-report_Omicron-tsunami_2022_FINAL_ENG.pdf)

<sup>95</sup> Erikstrup C, Laksafoss AD, Gladov J, Kaspersen KA, Mikkelsen S, Hindhede L, Boldsen JK, Jørgensen SW, Ethelberg S, Holm DK, Bruun MT, Nissen J, Schwinn M, Brodersen T, Mikkelsen C, Sækmose SG, Sørensen E, Harritshøj LH, Aagaard B, Dinh KM, Busch MP, Jørgensen CS, Krause TG, Ullum H, Ostrowski SR, Espenhain L, Pedersen OBV. Seroprevalence and infection fatality rate of the SARS-CoV-2 Omicron variant in Denmark: A nationwide serosurveillance study. *Lancet Reg Health Eur*. 2022 Oct;21:100479. doi: 10.1016/j.lanepe.2022.100479.